

**COMPARISON OF S.F. NO. 4 (Anderson), S.F. NO. 74 (Prettner Solon),
S.F. NO. 145 (Governor's Proposal), and S.F. NO. 129 (Tomasonni)**

S.F. No. 4 (Anderson)	S.F. No. 74 (Prettner Solon)	S.F. No. 145 (Governor)	S.F. No. 129 (Tomasonni)
RENEWABLES COUNTED			
Hydropower capacity increased from 60 to 100 MW	Same	Same In addition, a hydroelectric facility of any capacity may count if necessary to minimize excessive rate impacts on its customers	Same
Except for hydropower and biomass facilities located within the state, must have been installed by January 1, 1975	No comparable provision	No comparable provision	Renewable sources of any kind may be counted. Energy must be generated by a facility located in the United States that was originally placed in service after January 1, 1975, unless the facility is a municipally owned hydroelectric plant in Minnesota that provides electricity only to a municipal utility
No comparable provision	Eliminates biomass set aside	The biomass set aside of one percent is repealed	Eliminates biomass set aside
SIZE OF PROPOSAL			
11 percent by 2013		10 percent in 2010	
15 percent by 2015	blank percent by 2015	15 percent in 2015	10 percent in 2015
25 percent by 2020	blank percent by 2020	20 percent in 2020	20 percent in 2020
		25 percent in 2025	

S.F. No. 4 (Anderson)	S.F. No. 74 (Prettner Solon)	S.F. No. 145 (Governor)	S.F. No. 129 (Tomassoni)
LABEL TO DESCRIBE OBLIGATION			
Changes to standard after 2010	Retains good-faith effort objective of current law	Retains good-faith effort objective of current law	Converts to a standard
HOW PUC MODIFIES STANDARD OR OBJECTIVE			
MUST modify or delay if compliance not in public interest because compliance will either produce undesirable impacts on the reliability of the utility's system or on the utility's ratepayers or is not technically feasible.	MAY modify or delay if commission makes same findings as required under S.F. No. 4 with addition that it also must give strong consideration to the legislative policy of achieving the objective and the preference for renewables. In addition, the commission may increase a utility's objective if it finds it in the public interest. Further, the commission is directed to consider a utility's load growth and the availability of a tradable credit system when considering whether to modify or delay an objective.	Defines "good-faith effort" as all reasonable steps to meet the objective while minimizing adverse reliability and cost impacts. Codifies the Public Utilities Commission tests and allows other factors to be considered.	PUC is required to delay or modify a standard if compliance is not in the public interest. An expanded list of factors to consider when making the public interest determination is added. Commission bound by findings of fact related to the public interest determination factors made by the governing body of a generation and transmission cooperative association or municipal power agency or power district.
COMPLIANCE			
Adds a compliance provisions that is similar to S.F. No. 74 but requires the imposition of a penalty in certain situations. Applies only to standard and not to objective obligation of utility.	Similar to S.F. No. 4, but simply authorizes a penalty rather than requiring it and has a different penalty structure. Applies to all good-faith effort objective obligations.	Plan to make up the deficit must be filed. Requires an administrative penalty of \$50 per megawatt-hour of compliance deficit against an electric utility found not to have made a good-faith effort unless caused by circumstances beyond control of the utility. Penalty to be deposited into next generation energy fund.	PUC may order a utility to construct facilities or purchase credits to achieve compliance. Commission may impose a financial penalty up to the cost of compliance for violating an order.
WEIGHTED SCALE OF RENEWABLES			

S.F. No. 4 (Anderson)	S.F. No. 74 (Prettner Solon)	S.F. No. 145 (Governor)	S.F. No. 129 (Tomassoni)
Repeals	Repeals	Repeals	Repeals
ELECTRIC UTILITY SUBJECT TO LAW			
Keeps current law	Keeps current law	Keeps current law	Keeps current law
TRADABLE CREDIT PROGRAM			
No substantive change	Requires PUC to create	Keeps current law	Requires tradable credit program no later than January 1, 2008. Sets some program terms.
OTHER			
	<p>Requires Commissioner of Commerce to study and report to the Legislature concerning the wisdom of allowing certain conservation investments to count toward the REO</p> <p>Requires a concerted state government effort to develop a strategy that maximizes the state's economic return from renewable investments and operation</p>	<p>Authorizes an electric utility to make a compliance payment approved by Commission.</p> <p>Good-faith efforts to make at least 25 percent of power purchase agreement payments to community energy projects. Utility may count each kilowatt-hour under a community-based project as 1.2 kilowatt-hours.</p> <p>Next generation energy fund for the development of new renewable energy projects in the state.</p> <p>Planning for transmission necessary to accommodate the expanded renewables and to transmit 20,000 megawatts of windpower from the Midwest.</p>	